# On the basic estimation problem for symmetric 

 random graphs and networks
## Olav Kallenberg

Aarhus, 8/14-16, 2017

```
On the basic
estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
    networks
        Olav
Kallenberg
1. Graphs and graphons
2. Exchangeable representations
3. Basic estimation problem
```


## 1. Graphs and Graphons

## On the basic

estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg
Aarhus,
8/14-16, 2017

A directed graph $G$ consists of a countable set $S$ of nodes, and an array of pairwise interactions $x_{i j}: i \rightarrow j$, where we allow $x_{i j} \neq x_{j i}$. In a general network we may have two sets of nodes, $S$ and $T$, along with some pairwise interactions $x_{i j}$, $(i, j) \in S \times T$. To reduce to the previous case, we may replace $S$ by $S \cup T$.

We often assume $x_{i j} \in\{0,1\}$ for all $(i, j)$, where 1 means existence of a (directed) link from $i$ to $j$. The array $x=\left(x_{i j}\right)$ is then called the adjacency matrix. A colored graph is one where the $x_{i j}$ take more general values (=colors).

## Random graphs and graphons

## On the basic

estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg

Aarhus,

In a random graph, the interactions $x_{i j}$ are random variables, now denoted by $\xi_{i j}$. The simplest case is when the $\xi_{i j}$ are independent with distributions $\mu_{i j}$. Or, we may take the pairs $\left(\xi_{i j}, \xi_{j i}\right)$ to be independent with distributions $\mu_{i j}$, which includes the case of symmetric interactions $\xi_{i j}=\xi_{j i}$.

For on/off interactions, it is enough to specify the probabilities $p_{i j}=P\left\{\xi_{i j}=1\right\}$, but in general we need to specify the entire distributions $\mu_{i j}$. The array $M=\left(\mu_{i j}\right)$, called the graphon of $X$, clearly determines the distribution of the whole array $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$.

## On the basic

estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg

Aarhus 8/14-16, 2017

Now randomize with respect to the graphon $M=\left(\mu_{i j}\right)$. Thus, even $M$ is considered as random, and we choose the $\xi_{i j}$ to be conditionally independent, given $M$, with random distributions $\mu_{i j}$, so that

$$
\mathcal{L}\left(\xi_{i j} \mid M\right)=\mu_{i j}, \quad i, j \in S
$$

In other words, we first choose the graphon $M$ at random, and then, given $M$, we choose an array $X$ with graphon $M$. Though the distribution $\mathcal{L}(M)$ clearly determines $\mathcal{L}(X)$, the converse is false in general. (Thus, estimation of $\mathcal{L}(M)$ makes no sense!)

## 2. Exchangeable Representations

## Symmetric graphs and arrays

## On the basic

estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg
Aarhus,
8/14-16, 2017

An random graph or array $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$ is said to be jointly exchangeable if its distribution is invariant under permutations $\pi=\left(\pi_{i}\right)$ of the index set $S$, in the sense that

$$
X \circ \pi^{\otimes 2}=\left(\xi_{\pi_{i}, \pi_{j}} ; i, j \in S\right) \stackrel{d}{=} X
$$

We may also consider separately exchangeable arrays $X$, where invariance is assumed under possibly different permutations $\pi^{\prime}$ and $\pi^{\prime \prime}$ in the two indices:

$$
X \circ\left(\pi^{\prime} \otimes \pi^{\prime \prime}\right)=\left(\xi_{\pi_{i}^{\prime}, \pi_{j}^{\prime \prime}} ; i, j \in S\right) \stackrel{d}{=} X
$$

## Aldous-Hoover representations

## On the basic

estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg
Aarhus, 8/14-16, 2017

- An infinite array $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$ is jointly exchangeable iff

$$
\xi_{i j}=f\left(\alpha, \beta_{i}, \beta_{j}, \gamma_{i j}\right), \quad i, j \in S
$$

for some measurable function $f$ on $[0,1]^{4}$ and some i.i.d. $U(0,1)$ variables $\alpha, \beta_{i}$, and $\gamma_{i j}=\gamma_{j i}$.

- An infinite array $X$ is separately exchangeable iff

$$
\xi_{i j}=f\left(\alpha, \beta_{i}^{\prime}, \beta_{j}^{\prime \prime}, \gamma_{i j}\right), \quad i, j \in S
$$

for some $f$ as before and some i.i.d. $U(0,1)$ variables $\alpha$, $\beta_{i}^{\prime}, \beta_{j}^{\prime \prime}, \gamma_{i j}$.

## Reduction to ergodic case

## On the basic

estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg
Aarhus,
8/14-16, 2017

If we consider only a single graph or network (sample of size 1 ), we may reduce to the ergodic case where $\alpha$ is a constant:

- $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$ is ergodic jointly exchangeable iff

$$
\xi_{i j}=f\left(\beta_{i}, \beta_{j}, \gamma_{i j}\right), \quad i, j \in S
$$

■ $X$ is ergodic separately exchangeable iff

$$
\xi_{i j}=f\left(\beta_{i}^{\prime}, \beta_{j}^{\prime \prime}, \gamma_{i j}\right), \quad i, j \in S
$$

for some function $f$ on $[0,1]^{3}$ and some i.i.d. $U(0,1)$ random variables $\beta_{i}, \gamma_{i j}$ or $\beta_{i}^{\prime}, \beta_{j}^{\prime \prime}, \gamma_{i j}$.

## Exchangeable graphon representation

## On the basic

estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg

Aarhus
8/14-16, 2017

The latter arrays are conditional graphon models with simple symmetric arrays of conditional distributions

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mu_{i j}=\Phi\left(\beta_{i}, \beta_{j}\right), \quad i, j \in S \\
& \mu_{i j}=\Phi\left(\beta_{i}^{\prime}, \beta_{j}^{\prime \prime}\right), \quad i, j \in S
\end{aligned}
$$

respectively, where

$$
\Phi(x, y)=\mathcal{L}\{f(x, y, \vartheta)\}, \quad x, y \in[0,1]
$$

for a $U(0,1)$ random variable $\vartheta$. In this case, the distributions of $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$ and $M=\left(\mu_{i j}\right)$ do determine each other uniquely, and it makes sense to estimate $\mathcal{L}(M)$.

## On the basic

estimation problem for
symmetric
random graphs and networks

Olav
Kallenberg
Aarhus, 8/14-16, 2017

The representations of symmetric arrays are not unique: For a simple, jointly exchangeable array, we may replace $f$ by

$$
g(x, y)=f(T(x), T(y)), \quad x, y \in[0,1]
$$

for any measure-preserving function $T$. For a simple, separately exchangeable array, we may replace $f$ by

$$
g(x, y)=f\left(T_{1}(x), T_{2}(y)\right), \quad x, y \in[0,1]
$$

for some measure-preserving functions $T_{1}$ and $T_{2}$.
The general equivalence criteria involve additional randomization variables. (This is because measure-preserving functions, unlike permutations, are not invertible in general.)

## 3. Basic Estimation Problem

## Estimation problem for exchangeable graphs

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \begin{array}{c}
\text { On the basic } \\
\text { estimation } \\
\text { problem for } \\
\text { symmetric } \\
\text { random } \\
\text { graphs and } \\
\text { networks }
\end{array} \\
& \begin{array}{c}
\text { Olav } \\
\text { Kallenberg }
\end{array} \\
& \begin{array}{l}
\text { Aarhus, } \\
8 / 14-16,2017
\end{array} \\
& \\
& \\
& \text { astimationgle observation of the exchangeable } \\
& \text { array } X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Theorem 1: For any separately or jointly exchangeable array $X$, there exist some simple exchangeable arrays $X_{1}, X_{2}, \ldots$, such that as $n \rightarrow \infty$

$$
\mathcal{L}_{m}\left(X_{n}\right) \rightarrow \mathcal{L}_{m}(X), \quad m \in \mathrm{~N}
$$

where $\mathcal{L}_{m}$ denotes the distribution of the $m \times m$ subarray.
Conclusion: Based on observations of finite subarrays, we can't see the difference between simple and more general arrays, and we can just as well assume that $X$ is simple to begin with, which seems to simplify the problem. But then $M=X$, and there is nothing to estimate!

## Estimation by grid processes

## On the basic

estimation problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg

Aarhus,

Consider a real, infinite array $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$ with $n \times n$ sub-arrays $X_{n}$. For each $n \in \mathrm{~N}$, divide $[0,1]$ into sub-intervals $I_{n j}$ of length $n^{-1}$, and introduce the grid process

$$
\varphi_{n}(x, y)=\xi_{i j}, \quad(x, y) \in I_{n i} \times I_{n j}, i, j \leq n
$$

Theorem 2: If $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$ is simple, ergodic, jointly or separately exchangeable with representation

$$
\xi_{i j}=f\left(\beta_{i}, \beta_{j}\right) \quad \text { or } \quad \xi_{i j}=f\left(\beta_{i}^{\prime}, \beta_{j}^{\prime \prime}\right),
$$

then

$$
\inf _{f^{\prime} \sim f}\left\|\varphi_{n}-f^{\prime}\right\| \xrightarrow{P} 0
$$

To achieve uniqueness, we may sometimes diagonalize.
Theorem 3: Let $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$ be simple, ergodic, and $L^{2}$-valued.
■ When $X$ is symmetric, jointly exchangeable,

$$
f=\sum_{k} \alpha_{k}\left(\varphi_{k} \otimes \varphi_{k}\right)
$$

- When $X$ is separately exchangeable,

$$
f=\sum_{k} \alpha_{k}\left(\varphi_{k} \otimes \psi_{k}\right)
$$

Here the eigenvalues $\alpha_{k}$ are unique, and so are the eigenfunctions $\varphi_{k}$ and $\psi_{k}$, up to suitable rotations.

No invariant diagonalization seems to exist in the general jointly exchangeable case.

## Suggested estimation of graphon representation

On the basic
estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg
Aarhus,

Consider a real-valued, ergodic, jointly exchangeable array $X=\left(\xi_{i j}\right)$. For any $r \in \mathrm{R}$, form the 0-1 array

$$
X_{i j}(r)=1\left\{X_{i j} \geq r\right\}, \quad i, j \in S
$$

Given an observation of the $m \times m$ subarray $X^{m}$,

- form the grid processes based on $X(r)$,
- diagonalize and keep only the leading terms,
- estimate by functions that are monotone in $r$.

On the basic
estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg

Aarhus
8/14-16, 2017

The suggested procedure leads to the following statistical problems:

- Assuming suitable smoothness of the underlying graphon, choose an optimal truncation level, depending on the size $m$ of the subarray.
■ Prove that the resulting estimators are consistent and converge to the representation function of the graphon.
Note that this is essentially a problem of optimal filtering.


## References

On the basic
estimation
problem for
symmetric
random
graphs and
networks
Olav
Kallenberg
Aarhus,

- Aldous, D.J. (1981). Representations for partially exchangeable arrays of random variables. JMA 11, 581-598.
- Hoover, D.N. (1979). Relations on probability spaces and arrays of random variables. Preprint, Princeton University.
- Kallenberg, O. (1989). On the representation theorem for exchangeable arrays. JMA 30, 137-154.
-     - (1999). Multivariate sampling and the estimation problem for exchangeable arrays. JTP 12, 859-883.
■ - (2005). Probabilistic Symmetries and Invariance Principles. Springer.

